

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

| |
|---|
| <p style="text-align:center">IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD ANTITRUST LITIGATION (MDL No. 2406)</p> |
|---|

Master File No. 2:13-CV-20000-RDP

This document relates to Provider-Track cases.

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION REGARDING THE ANTITRUST STANDARD OF REVIEW
APPLICABLE TO PROVIDER PLAINTIFFS' SECTION 1 CLAIMS PURSUANT TO
FEDERAL RULE OF CIVIL PROCEDURE 56**

Defendants hereby move, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56, for an order granting summary judgment for Defendants on Provider Plaintiffs' *per se* Claims arising under Section 1 of the Sherman Act. For the reasons set forth in Defendants' accompanying Opening Brief on the Antitrust Standard of Review Applicable to Provider Plaintiffs' Section 1 Claims, Defendants respectfully request that the Court grant their Motion in its entirety and analyze Provider Plaintiffs' Section 1 claims under the rule of reason.

Dated: May 21, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Evan R. Chesler

Evan R. Chesler

Christine A. Varney

Karin A. DeMasi

Lauren R. Kennedy

David H. Korn

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

Worldwide Plaza

825 Eighth Avenue

New York, NY 10019

Tel: (212) 474-1000

Fax: (212) 474-3700

echesler@cravath.com

cvarney@cravath.com

kdemasi@cravath.com

lkennedy@cravath.com

dkorn@cravath.com

*Coordinating Counsel for Defendant
Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association;
Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Alabama; Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross
and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.;
BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee,
Inc.; CareFirst, Inc.; CareFirst of
Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization
and Medical Services, Inc.; CareFirst
BlueChoice, Inc.; Health Care Service
Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal
Reserve Company, including its
divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue
Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for
Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.*

Craig A. Hoover
E. Desmond Hogan
Justin Bernick
Peter Bisio
Elizabeth Jose
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
Columbia Square
555 13th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 637-5600
Fax: (202) 637-5910
craig.hoover@hoganlovells.com
desmond.hogan@hoganlovells.com
justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com
peter.bisio@hoganlovells.com
elizabeth.jose@hoganlovells.com

John D. Martin
Lucile H. Cohen
Travis A. Bustamante
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor
Columbia, SC 29201
Tel: (803) 255-9421
Fax: (803) 256-7500
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Cavender C. Kimble
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 1500
Birmingham, AL 35203-4642
Tel: (205) 226-3437
Fax: (205) 488-5860
ckimble@balch.com

*Counsel for Anthem, Inc., f/k/a WellPoint, Inc.,
and all of its named subsidiaries in this
consolidated action; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
North Carolina, Inc.; Louisiana Health Service &
Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield
of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue
Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield
of South Carolina; Horizon Healthcare Services,*

David J. Zott, P.C.
Daniel E. Laytin, P.C.
Sarah J. Donnell
Christa C. Cottrell, P.C.
Zachary Holmstead
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
300 North LaSalle
Chicago, IL 60654
Tel: (312) 862-2000
Fax: (312) 862-2200
david.zott@kirkland.com
daniel.laytin@kirkland.com
sarah.donnell@kirkland.com
christa.cottrell@kirkland.com
zachary.holmstead@kirkland.com

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)
Mark M. Hogewood
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &
BRANDT, LLC
First Commercial Bank Building
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 870-0555
Fax: (205) 871-7534
kwest@wallacejordan.com
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

*Counsel for Blue Cross Blue Shield
Association*

James L. Priester
Carl S. Burkhalter
John Thomas A. Malatesta, III
MAYNARD COOPER & GALE PC
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 2400
Regions Harbert Plaza
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 254-1000
Fax: (205) 254-1999
jpriester@maynardcooper.com
cburkhalter@maynardcooper.com
jmalatesta@maynardcooper.com

Pamela B. Slate

Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon

Gwendolyn Payton
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND & STOCKTON LLP
1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3700
Seattle, WA 98101
Tel: (206) 626-7714
Fax: (206) 299-0414
gpayton@kilpatricktownsend.com

J. Bentley Owens, III
ELLIS, HEAD, OWENS & JUSTICE
113 North Main Street
Columbiana, AL 35051-0587
Tel: (205) 669-6783
Fax: (205) 669-4932
bowens@wefhlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Premera Blue Cross,
d/b/a Premera Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alaska*

Brian K. Norman
SHAMOUN & NORMAN, LLP
1800 Valley View Lane, Suite 200
Farmers Branch, TX 75234
Tel: (214) 987-1745
Fax: (214) 521-9033
bkn@snlegal.com

H. James Koch
ARMBRECHT JACKSON LLP
RSA Tower, 27th Floor
11 North Water Street
Mobile, AL 36602
Tel: (251) 405-1300
Fax: (251) 432-6843
hjk@ajlaw.com

HILL CARTER FRANCO COLE &
BLACK, P.C.
425 South Perry Street
Montgomery, AL 36104
Tel: (334) 834-7600
Fax: (334) 386-4381
pslate@hillhillcarter.com

*With Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP,
counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue
Shield of Alabama*

Helen E. Witt, P.C.
Jeffrey J. Zeiger, P.C.
Erica B. Zolner
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
300 North LaSalle
Chicago, IL 60654
Tel: (312) 862-2000
Fax: (312) 862-2200
hwitt@kirkland.com
jzeiger@kirkland.com
ezolner@kirkland.com

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)
Mark M. Hogewood
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &
BRANDT, LLC
First Commercial Bank Building
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 870-0555
Fax: (205) 871-7534
kwest@wallacejordan.com
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

*Counsel for Defendants Health Care
Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual
Legal Reserve Company, including its
divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue
Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for*

Counsel for Defendants CareFirst, Inc.; CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.; CareFirst BlueChoice, Inc.

R. David Kaufman
M. Patrick McDowell
BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER
& HEWES, PLLC
190 East Capitol Street
The Pinnacle Building, Suite 100
Jackson, MS 39201
Tel: (601) 948-3101
Fax: (601) 960-6902
dkaufman@brunini.com
pmcdowell@brunini.com

John D. Martin
Lucile H. Cohen
Travis A. Bustamante
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor
Columbia, SC 29201
Tel: (803) 255-9421
Fax: (803) 256-7500
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Cheri D. Green
BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD OF MISSISSIPPI
P.O. Box 1043
Jackson, MS 39215
Tel: (601) 932-3704
cdgreen@bcbsms.com

Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue Shield of Mississippi, a Mutual Insurance Company

Michael A. Naranjo
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP
555 California Street, Suite 1700
San Francisco, CA 94104
Tel: (415) 984-9847

Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark Inc., f/k/a Highmark Health Services; Highmark West Virginia Inc.; Highmark Blue Cross Blue Shield Delaware Inc.; California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California

Jonathan M. Redgrave
REDGRAVE, LLP
14555 Avion Parkway, Suite 275
Chantilly, VA 20151
Tel: (703) 592-1155
Fax: (612) 332-8915
jredgrave@redgravellp.com

Additional Counsel for HCSC and Highmark Defendants

Todd Stenerson
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
401 9th Street, N.W., Suite 800
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 508-8000
Fax: (202) 508-8100
todd.stenerson@shearman.com

Sarah L. Cylkowski
Thomas J. Rheume, Jr.
BODMAN PLC
1901 Saint Antoine Street
6th Floor at Ford Field
Detroit, MI 48226
Tel: (313) 259-7777
Fax: (734) 930-2494
scylkowski@bodmanlaw.com
trheume@bodmanlaw.com

Andy P. Campbell
A. Todd Campbell
Yawanna N. McDonald
CAMPBELL PARTNERS LLC
505 North 20th Street, Suite 1600
Birmingham, AL 35203

Fax: (415) 434-4507
mnaranjo@foley.com

Alan D. Rutenberg
Benjamin R. Dryden
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP
3000 K Street, N.W., Suite 600
Washington, DC 20007
Tel: (202) 672-5300
Fax: (202) 672-5399
arutenberg@foley.com
bdryden@foley.com

*Counsel for Defendant US Able Mutual Insurance
Company, d/b/a Arkansas Blue Cross and
Blue Shield*

Robert K. Spotswood
Michael T. Sansbury
Joshua K. Payne
Jess R. Nix
Morgan B. Franz
SPOTSWOOD SANSOM & SANSBURY LLC
Financial Center
505 20th Street North, Suite 700
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 986-3620
Fax: (205) 986-3639
rks@spotswoodllc.com
msansbury@spotswoodllc.com
jpayne@spotswoodllc.com
jnix@spotswoodllc.com
mfranz@spotswoodllc.com

Counsel for Defendant Capital BlueCross

Evan R. Chesler
Christine A. Varney
Karin A. DeMasi
Lauren R. Kennedy
David H. Korn
CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP
Worldwide Plaza
825 Eighth Avenue

Tel: (205) 224-0750
Fax: (205) 224-8622
andy@campbellpartnerslaw.com
todd@campbellpartnerslaw.com
yawanna@campbellpartnerslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross and
Blue Shield of Michigan*

John Briggs
Rachel Adcox
Jeny M. Maier
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER,
LLP
1901 L Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036
Tel: (202) 912-4700
Fax: (202) 912-4701
jbriggs@axinn.com
radcox@axinn.com
jmaier@axinn.com

Stephen A. Rowe
Aaron G. McLeod
ADAMS AND REESE LLP
Regions Harbert Plaza
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 3000
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 250-5000
Fax: (205) 250-5034
steve.rowe@arlaw.com
aaron.mcleod@arlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Independence
Blue Cross*

Kathleen Taylor Sooy
Tracy A. Roman
Sarah Gilbert
Honor Costello
CROWELL & MORING LLP
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 624-2500

New York, NY 10019
Tel: (212) 474-1000
Fax: (212) 474-3700
echesler@cravath.com
cvarney@cravath.com
kdemasi@cravath.com
lkennedy@cravath.com
dkorn@cravath.com

John D. Martin
Lucile H. Cohen
Travis A. Bustamante
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor
Columbia, SC 29201
Tel: (803) 255-9421
Fax: (803) 256-7500
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Robert R. Riley, Jr.
RILEY & JACKSON, P.C.
3530 Independence Drive
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 879-5000
Fax: (205) 879-5901
rob@rileyjacksonlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and Blue
Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield
of Massachusetts, Inc.; BlueCross BlueShield
of Tennessee, Inc.*

Edward S. Bloomberg
John G. Schmidt
Anna Mercado Clark
PHILLIPS LYTLE LLP
One Canalside
125 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14203
Tel: (716) 847-8400
Fax: (716) 852-6100
ebloomberg@phillipslytle.com

Fax: (202) 628-5116
ksooy@crowell.com
troman@crowell.com
sgilbert@crowell.com
hcostello@crowell.com

John M. Johnson
Brian P. Kappel
LIGHTFOOT FRANKLIN & WHITE
LLC
The Clark Building
400 20th Street North
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 581-0700
Fax: (205) 581-0799
jjohnson@lightfootlaw.com
bkappel@lightfootlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross of
Idaho Health Service, Inc.; Blue Cross
and Blue Shield of Kansas, Inc.; Blue
Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas City;
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of
Nebraska; Blue Cross Blue Shield of
Arizona; Blue Cross Blue Shield of
North Dakota; Blue Cross Blue Shield
of Wyoming; Highmark Western and
Northeastern New York Inc.*

David J. Zott, P.C.
Daniel E. Laytin, P.C.
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
300 North LaSalle
Chicago, IL 60654
Tel: (312) 862-2000
Fax: (312) 862-2200
david.zott@kirkland.com
daniel.laytin@kirkland.com

John Martin
Lucile H. Cohen
Travis A. Bustamante
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor

jschmidt@phillipslytle.com
aclark@phillipslytle.com

Stephen A. Walsh
WEINBERG, WHEELER, HUDGINS,
GUNN & DIAL
100 Corporate Parkway
One Lake Level
Birmingham, AL 35242
Tel: (205) 572-4107
Fax: (205) 572-4199
swalsh@wwhgd.com

*Counsel for Defendant, Excellus Health Plan, Inc.,
d/b/a Excellus BlueCross BlueShield, incorrectly
sued as Excellus BlueCross BlueShield of
New York*

Columbia, SC 29201
Tel: (803) 255-9421
Fax: (803) 256-7500
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

*Counsel for Defendants Wellmark of
South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue
Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota);
Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross
and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii
Medical Service Association (Blue
Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii);
Triple-S Salud, Inc.*

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)
Mark M. Hogewood
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &
BRANDT, LLC
First Commercial Bank Building
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 870-0555
Fax: (205) 871-7534
kwest@wallacejordan.com
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

*Counsel for Defendants Wellmark of
South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue
Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota);
Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross
and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii
Medical Service Association (Blue
Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii)*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 21, 2021, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Evan R. Chesler
Evan R. Chesler